

APPENDIX D: PLAN FORMULATION



DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY
U.S. ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS, NEW ORLEANS DISTRICT
7400 LEAKE AVE
NEW ORLEANS, LA 70118-3651

CEMVN-PD

22 FEB 2022

MEMORANDUM FOR RECORD

SUBJECT: West Shore Lake Pontchartrain (WSLP) Mitigation, Swamp Tentatively Selected Alternative (TSA)

1. On January 31, 2020, the Coastal Protection and Restoration Authority (CPRA) submitted a letter to the CEMVN requesting that the Maurepas Swamp Project (MSP) be considered as a compensatory mitigation project to mitigate for unavoidable impacts to swamp habitat from construction of the WSLP Project. On February 6, 2020, CEMVN assembled a Project Delivery Team (PDT) to assess the viability of the Maurepas Swamp Project as a potential compensatory mitigation alternative for the WSLP Project. At that time, draft Environmental Assessment (EA) 576 addressed compensatory mitigation for habitat impacts associated with each of the Bipartisan Budget Act (BBA) of 2018-funded flood risk reduction projects, including the WSLP Project. EA 576 recommended the purchase of mitigation bank credits and construction of new swamp habitat to compensate for swamp habitat that will be lost due to construction of the WSLP Project. The Finding of No Significant Impact for EA 576 was signed by the CEMVN District Commander on April 4, 2020.

2. On September 23, 2021 an Alternatives Evaluation and Comparison (AEC) was conducted to evaluate three alternatives to mitigate swamp impacts incurred as a result of the WSLP project. The three alternatives evaluated include: Maurepas Swamp Alternative 1-MSA 1 (private and public lands), Maurepas Swamp Alternative 2- MSA-2 (public lands only), and Alternative 3-the BBA Alternative (identified in EA 576). The PDT then evaluated these projects using the design data documented during the alternatives development phase as well as input provided by the non-Federal sponsor and the interagency team during an August 2021 inter-agency workshop. The PDT prepared a brief on the results of the AEP (presentation attached).

3. Alternative 3, the Bipartisan Budget Act (BBA) Alternative, received the highest scores in the AEC and was confirmed as the Tentatively Selected Alternative (TSA). The AEC process compares projects mitigating the same habitat to each other in relation to six main criteria: Risk and Reliability, Environmental, Watershed and Ecological Site Considerations, Time and Schedule, Cost Effectiveness, and Other Cost Considerations. Weighting of these criteria are established based on importance determined by the PDT. Once the initial evaluation was complete, a sensitivity analysis was determined to be unnecessary because increasing the importance of the Risk and Reliability, Time and Schedule, Cost Effectiveness and Other Cost Considerations criteria would not result in a change in the selected project for swamp habitat.

CEMVN-PD

SUBJECT: West Shore Lake Pontchartrain (WSLP) Mitigation, Swamp Tentatively Selected Alternative (TSA)

4. The primary criteria that resulted in the higher AEC score for the BBA Alternative were Cost Effectiveness, Other Cost Considerations and Risk and Reliability. The next ranked Plans MSA-1, which includes both Private and Public Lands in the benefit area, and MSA-2, which includes only Public Lands in the benefit area, scored lower in Cost Effectiveness, Other Cost Considerations, Risk and Reliability and Environmental and higher in Watershed/Ecological and equal in Time. Both Maurepas Swamp alternatives were at least \$5M more expensive than the BBA alternative.

5. The Coastal Protection and Restoration Authority (CPRA), the Non-federal sponsor, in a letter dated 23 August 2021, requested consideration of Plan MSA-2 as a betterment. CPRA acknowledged that implementation of the Maurepas Swamp Project Alternative would be more costly than the BBA Alternative and agreed to be responsible for the increase in cost over the BBA Alternative.

6. In consideration of both the results of the AEC and the NFS request, it has been determined that the sponsor preferred alternative Maurepas Swamp Alternative 2 (public lands only), will satisfy the Swamp mitigation need generated by the WSLP project. The sponsor preferred alternative is selected for implementation as a betterment with the understanding that the Non-federal sponsor will be responsible for the increased cost over the BBA Alternative.



STEPHEN F. MURPHY
COL, EN
Commanding

From: "Blanke, Kenneth G Jr CIV USARMY CEMVN (USA)" <Kenneth.G.Blanke@usace.army.mil>
Date: March 28, 2022 at 1:01:20 PM CDT
To: Elizabeth Davoli <Elizabeth.Davoli@la.gov>
Cc: Brad Miller <Brad.Miller@la.gov>
Subject: MVN-2013-01561-CQ- CPRA- Mississippi River Reintroduction into Maurepas Swamp Project- Permit Application

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Please do not click on links or attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Dear Ms. Davoli,

Reference is made to the subject permit application for the Mississippi River Reintroduction into Maurepas Swamp Project (Regulatory File Number MVN-2013-01561-CQ). By email dated 18 October 2019, we had forwarded comments received during our Public Notice comment period and, to date, have yet to receive a response to comments or any additional information. Due to a period of inactivity associated with the file, we are formally withdrawing your permit request. Please note that if CPRA wishes to pursue this permit in the future, you must submit a new application and drawings.

We are hereby returning your permit application (attached). Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Kenny Blanke

Environmental Resources Specialist
Central Evaluation Branch
Regulatory Division
504-862-1217 phone
504-862-2574 fax
kenneth.g.blanke@usace.army.mil